

UX Café Report

Conducted on September 25, 2023 – Matthew Barry and Miriam Leslie

Research Goal

This study was conducted as part of an ongoing project to improve the design of location pages on the Western Libraries website. Location pages serve as the home page for each of our library's physical branches, providing information about the physical location, as well as resources related to the subject specialties of said library. The goal of this study was to identify the strengths and weaknesses of each of the three distinct prototypes that we had developed in order to continue to iteratively improve on our new location page design.

Methodology

This study used guerilla task analysis combined with comparative qualitative analysis. Passerby in the library were tasked with trying to perform a subset of the tasks below on one of the three prototype versions of the locations page that we had created. After performing the task(s), they were asked to repeat the study on each of the other two location pages, and then provide feedback.

Prototypes

Home > Music Library

Music Library

- All Libraries
- Print, Copy, Scan
- Equipment for Loan
- Course Readings
- Accessibility
- Faculty of Music



Music Library



Located in Talbot College, the Music Library offers a wide variety of resources to support the Don Wright Faculty of Music including books, scores, and the Choral/Band/Orchestral Collection.

Hours

Music	9am - 4:30pm
CBO	Closed

[CONTACT THE MUSIC LIBRARY](#)

Services



[In This Library](#)



[Study Spaces](#)

Research Tools



[Research Guides](#)



[Music Databases](#)



[Finding Music](#)



[Writing and Citing Music](#)

Collections



Prototype 1: The distinct features that set this prototype apart are:

- Side navigation contains links to non-library-specific resources
- Exterior shot of the building housing the library, paired with a short description and hours at the top of the page
- Large, thumbnail-styled links to services, research tools and collections, divided into logical categories

Music Library

Finding Music
Choral, Band, Orchestral
Faculty of Music

Hours

Music	9am - 4:30pm
CBO	Closed



Music Library



EQUIPMENT FOR LOAN

COURSE READINGS

PRINTING

PARKING

The Music Library is located in Talbot College, rm. 234, at the top of the central staircase (look to your right). When taking the elevator, the library is directly across from the elevator lobby on the second floor. The Choral / Band / Orchestral (CBO) primarily supports large ensemble performance activities and music education courses of the Don Wright Faculty of Music. It is located on the main floor of Talbot College, TC 134.

Contact the Music Library by phone 519-661-3913 or [email](#).

Music Library
Western University
Talbot College, Room 234
1151 Richmond Street
London, ON, Canada
N6A 3K7

Spaces and Services

Citing and Writing

Music Research Guides

Music Databases

Library FAQs

Special Collections

Prototype 2: The distinct features that set this prototype apart are:

- Side navigation contains music-library-adjacent resources only, with more general resources on the home page
- Larger top content area with images of both the exterior and interior of the library, with description below
- Two rows of menu buttons for generic resources and library-specific resources.

Visit Us

Locations

- Weldon Library
- Taylor Library
- Business Library
- Law Library
- Music Library
- Map and Data Centre
- Western Archives
- Education Resource Centre

Print, Copy, Scan

Book a Study Space

Accessibility

Learning and Food Zones



Music Library



The Music Library features books, scores, spaces, media, and other resources to support the [Don Wright Faculty of Music](#) and other members of the Western community.

Hours

Music	9am - 4:30pm
CBO	Closed

[CONTACT THE MUSIC LIBRARY](#)

Visiting the Music Library

We are located in Talbot College Rm. 234, at the top of the central staircase (look to your right).



[PARKING](#)

[CAMPUS MAP](#)

[DIRECTIONS](#)

[FLOOR PLAN](#)

Mailing Address

The Music Library - Talbot College, Rm. 234
Western University

Prototype 3: The distinct features of this prototype are:

- Treats the “Visit Us” page as the home page of the navigation, rather than the location page
- Has most of the location-specific content embedded on the page, rather than linked to from the page
- Shows an image of the door to the music library, rather than an image of the exterior of the building.

Tasks

For all of these tasks, tell the user to imagine that they're a student enrolled in a music program.

1. "Imagine that you're writing a paper about a piece of music, and you want to figure out the correct way to cite the song that your paper is about. Where would you look to figure out how to do this?"
[goal: locate writing and citing music / citing and writing / writing about and citing music --- feel confident that this is the right resource]

2. "Imagine that you're enrolled in a music class and that you play the clarinet, and you need to find sheet music for the clarinet for an assignment. You've heard that this is something you can get through the Music Library. Where would you look for this?" [goal: locate finding music --- feel confident that this is the right resource]

3. "Imagine that you're on campus trying to practice playing an instrument for class, and you've realized that you could really benefit from a metronome. Where would you look to see if the music library had a metronome that you could borrow?" [goal: locate equipment for loan --- feel confident that this is the right resource]

Post-task questions

After each task, ask the user:

- Do you feel confident that you've found what you were looking for?
- How difficult do you feel that this task was to complete?

After user has seen other two prototypes, ask:

- Which prototype do you like the best and why?
- Is there a particular feature you like about one of the other two prototypes that you would like to see incorporated into the main one? If so, what is it and why?

Results

Tests performed starting with each prototype:

Prototype	Number of tests
1	2
2	4
3	4

Total number of users: 12

Prototype stated preferences:

Prototype	Users who preferred
1	5
2	6
3	1

Result: Split preference between prototypes 1 and 2. Prototype 3 has been removed from future consideration.

Reasons for preference and preferred features

(bold text represents a large number of users stating the same opinion)

Prototype 1:

- General feedback
 - **Liked the use of image thumbnails**
 - "clearest"
 - Compactness

- Similar in layout / design to other Western pages
- Feature comments:
 - Hours were very easy to notice
 - Liked the library blurb and hours being at the top of the page
 - Liked how the links were broken into logical sections

Prototype 2:

- General feedback
 - Liked that everything was on one screen
 - Compactness
 - Simple and easy to find content
- Feature comments:
 - Liked contact button at the top of the page
 - Liked how visually prominent the links were
 - Liked the row of buttons underneath the top image

Prototype 3:

- Feature comments:
 - Liked that there was an accordion menu for services that provided more detail on the same page

Reasons for disliking a prototype

Prototype 1:

- Wants more text / information

Prototype 3:

- “Everyone knows where to find the library, so the map shouldn’t be right at the top”
 - “if people want the address they can google it”
- Lots of detail, but not very quick to find things on
- Too much text; international students “didn’t want to scroll and read”

Task success rates

Prototype	Success Rate
1	0 of 2
2	3 of 4
3	1 or 4

Note that given the small sample size, these values aren’t statistically significant, and we shouldn’t assume that the exact values are meaningful. It appeared that users were generally less successful at completing tasks across interfaces than we expected, indicating a need to continue improving the selected interface.

Findings

Based on our observations, we determined the following:

Prototype 3 is no longer being considered. While we were initially excited about the idea of simplifying the navigational structure of location pages by moving more content onto the location page itself, this proved to be unpopular with students---especially international students, who found the large amount of text difficult to parse. Ultimately this test helped us to move away from this idea.

Prototypes 2 and 3 had similar preferences, but need work. We didn't get enough evidence to prove that one or the other of these interfaces were conclusively the best. If we had felt that users were navigating both interfaces confidently, we could potentially chose the one we liked best and implement it, but we felt that students were generally struggling more than we had hoped, which shows that we still needed to test more options for designs.

Three prototypes was too many! While we had successfully tested three prototypes at once in the past, we found during this test that it was hard to identify the specific elements of the prototypes that were working or not working; positive feedback between prototypes 1 and 2 had enough overlap that it was difficult to identify which parts of the design were working or not working. Therefore, our next test of the design will involve only comparing two prototypes, rather than three.

Next Steps

Given that users weren't able to complete tasks as easily and intuitively as we had hoped, and given that there wasn't a clear consensus between prototypes 1 and 2, we will be continuing to develop and test prototypes for this page. Our next test will involve creating two new prototypes with more distinct differences in how navigational elements are presented, in the hopes of soliciting a strong preference about which elements of the first two prototypes were working for our users, and to provide us with a clearer path forward on which design to continue improving.

If you have any questions or thoughts about these prototypes or what you would like to see on a location page, please contact Matt Barry (mbarry23@uwo.ca)